Terms of Reference
Short Term Consultant

Senior Researcher for Glass Ceiling in the Public Sector in Indonesia Consultation

| National or DFAT Remuneration Framework:¹ | National Consultant |
| Counterparts: | Prospera Government of Indonesia Partners |
| Work Location: | Jakarta |
| Reports to: | Lead Adviser Public Sector |
| Duration of inputs: | 100 days, from November 2019 – April 2020 |
| Budget source: | AP019 |

Summary of Glass-Ceiling² Study and Expertise Required

This study is aimed to better understand the factors, determinants and institutional issues for women seeking promotion in the Indonesian Civil Service. Women are significantly underrepresented in the Indonesian Civil Service as reported by an analysis of the personnel data from the Indonesian Civil Service by a World Bank report.³ The report indicates that only a third of the higher echelon levels are occupied by women. PROSPERA seeks to carry out a qualitative study to propose options for policy, initiatives to address the barriers with a focus on increasing women’s representation in senior leadership positions. In particular, the study will have three main objectives:

(a) Understand the barriers for women that are structural/institutional such as recruitment and selection system, regulations, rotation policy and any legislative barriers;
(b) Understand personal, perceived or actual/unconscious bias, including socio-cultural issues, family and work responsibilities; and
(c) The eco-system of leadership culture, work culture, expectations and inflexible work practices.

Prospera is seeking the services of a qualitative senior researcher.

The senior researcher must have: (a) expertise in gender economics; (b) track record of delivering high quality gender specific policy-research in Indonesia for governmental and non-governmental bodies; and (c) demonstrate value for money. PROSPERA staff will work closely in a team environment with the short-term expert. Interested persons/organisations will be asked to submit their expression of interest including detailed budget proposal.

The study will involve 4-6 focus groups discussions with 100 – 150 Government of Indonesia staff, translation and interpreting services will be procured, as well as resource materials to set the context and the rationale for the study for voluntary participants.

¹ To be negotiated with the preferred candidate based on skills and experience and within funding limits.
² ‘Glass ceiling’ is a common term that refers to the invisible barrier which hinders minorities, including women, to reach the highest level of leadership in an organisation regardless of their achievements or merit.

Prospera is supported by the Australian Government and implemented by Cardno
Background

There is limited research and data to identify and evaluate the current reality of gender imbalance in Indonesia’s senior civil service positions. Evidence from other countries suggest that factors such as negative stereotypes or unconscious bias about women’s competence and preference, double burden of household care-work and career ambition, lack of transparency in promotion process, and low number of women in the organisation’s talent pool have been frequently cited as the key issues that have contributed to the ‘glass ceiling’ problem in the public sector. Whilst these insights are useful to help explain the general problem of gender bias in public sector’s senior leadership positions, studies that evaluate and contextualise such findings in Indonesia are lacking.

International experiences further suggests that gender diversity especially matters not only for the public sector to have better representative of the society it serves, but also to ensure that the needs, aspirations and experiences of a diverse range of citizens are reflected in the decision-making process. Better representation of women in the decision-making process may also produce policies that address issues related to advancing women and girls’ participation in society. Accordingly, in advancing gender equality and women’s empowerment goals as part of Indonesia’s national development priority, it is important to understand this problem in order to enable improvements, retention and promotion of women across all tiers of the civil service hierarchy.

Rationale for the study

Equal opportunities for all citizen regardless of their gender has been part of Indonesia’s national development vision as instructed in the National Long-Term Development Plan (RPJPN) 2005-2025. One of the targets of gender equality and women empowerment agenda in the national development vision is to improve women’s representation in decision-making process. However, women are still under-represented in strategic leadership positions in Indonesia’s public and private sectors. In terms of labour force participation, in Indonesia, only 52.9% of women participate compared to 83.7% of men. This number is one of the lowest in Southeast Asian region and has remained stagnant despite massive changes in the Indonesian economy. Although enrolment in secondary and higher education is slightly higher for women than it is for men, yet this is not translating into gender parity in economic participation and opportunity. While the focus of this study is on the public sector and not the private sector, the above sets the context for women workers broadly.

Having a good diagnostic of the factors that are at play for women in the public sector is important as the public sector offers good, decent, reliable, respectable jobs for women. In fact, public sector in Indonesia employs a quarter of female workforce, making it the second

---

highest employer for women in the country. Increasing equality and equity of opportunity of work in this sector could provide critical benchmark for the labour force more broadly.

What the data shows?
The proportion of women in the public sector has increased to 51% in 2018, but women continue to be under-represented in structural positions of Echelon I-IV (only 33%) and over-represented in operational or functional positions (62%). Only 17% of Echelon I positions, which is the highest level of strategic leadership in the public sector, are held by women. This is below the G20 average of 26.4%, and Indonesia is ranked 15th amongst G20 countries in terms of the proportion of women in senior civil service position (only above India, China, Turkey, South Korea, Japan, and Saudi Arabia). This trend of women’s under-representation in senior civil service positions (Echelon I-IV) in Indonesia has been consistent for the last five years (2014-2018) and data from the National Civil Service Agency (BKN) does not suggest that education has correlation with promotion as female civil servants have higher education attainment compared to their male colleagues.

Against this background, PROSPERA seeks to recruit a senior qualitative researcher to carry out a study on understanding the barriers to women’s leadership in the public sector by examining to what extent factors related to socio-cultural and organisational structure have influenced the lack of women’s promotion to strategic decision-making positions. This study aims to identify evidence-based solutions for addressing the glass ceiling to improve women’s representation in the leadership position in Indonesia’s public sector.

Who are the target participants?
The target participants for digital survey will be female and male civil servants in central government institutions in Jakarta and at least two regional government institutions, preferably outside of Java. The exact number of the participants will be determined with the methodologist.

The target participants for interview and focus group discussions will be a total of 120 female and male civil servants with following details:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Number of Participants</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Echelon I (individual interview)</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Echelon II</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Echelon III</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Echelon IV</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Functional positions (below Echelon IV)</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total participants</strong></td>
<td><strong>120</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Scope of Services
The key roles and responsibilities of the Senior Researcher will be:

---

8 Calculation based on data from National Workforce Survey (Sakernas) 2018.
9 Calculation based on data from National Statistics Publication 2019 by BPS.
• **Preparation**: Work with PROSPERA’s Public Sector and Gender and Social Inclusion team to refine the ToR, a literature review of relevant studies, including developing a detailed project plan.

• **Implementation**: Compile and review existing literature/data, conduct original quantitative and qualitative research based on the methods agreed in consultation with Prospera’s team and the methodologist. Design of the focus group discussions and data collection.

• **Validation and dissemination**: Disseminate preliminary findings upon completion of the study to PROSPERA staff and other relevant stakeholders in order to validate results and fine tune policy recommendations.

• **Results**: Document the key findings and actions in a report, power point presentation and 4-page policy brief.

• **Work** effectively with Gender and Public Sector Leads, the methodologist, and the Prospera team.

### Output/Deliverables
The position is expected to deliver the following outputs over the term of the contract to the satisfaction of the PROSPERA Lead Adviser:

- **Output 1**: Detailed timeline, workplan, draft outline. This should include detailed methodology of the study, including the justification in selecting data sources and methods of analysis. It should also include detailed breakdown of all estimated costs, including estimated number of experts involved in the study, their roles, and number of working days.

- **Output 2**: Preliminary results of the study in word and power point format.

- **Output 3**: Presentation of results to PROSPERA, and other relevant stakeholders.

- **Output 4**: Final completion report, policy brief and power point presentation incorporating feedback and inputs from Output 3. This should be in a format supplied by PROSPERA and approved by Lead Adviser Public Sector, PROSPERA’s Senior Adviser (Public Sector) upon the completion of the assignment.

In addition to these formal deliverables, the position is expected to regularly communicate with relevant staff from PROSPERA’s Public Sector and Gender and Social Inclusion Team on progress and seek input where required.

### Selection Criteria – Qualifications and Experience
The consultant will possess strong qualifications and experience to support the study on the factors, determinants and institutional issues for women who are seeking promotion to leadership positions in the Indonesian Civil Service and have deep understanding on survey and focus group discussion process. Skills and expertise include:

- **Master’s degree** in a relevant field such as gender studies, economics, development, public policy, politics, or related areas (relevant postgraduate qualifications highly desirable).

- **Minimum of five years of experience** carrying out policy-research on gender and economy, including on women’s employment and care economy. Strong quantitative and qualitative skills.
• Proven track record of **high-quality, policy-research reports and presentation** of research results that meet clients’ standards. Those with a proven track record of working with and influencing policy makers in Indonesia will be prioritized.
• Ability to operate under **strict time limits and apply high production and technical standards** for the purpose of maintaining high level of professionalism.
• Ability to operate effectively and sensitively in a cross-cultural environment.
• **Jakarta-based**, native Indonesian speakers with a good command of written and spoken English. A combination of Jakarta and international experts will also be accepted.

The consultant **must supply work samples in addition to two references** (from contact information) from previous clients.

**Timeline for the Study**

- **OCTOBER 2019**
  - TOR development & recruitment
  - Background research
  - Personnel selection
- **DECEMBER 2019**
  - Testing sample size in research locations
- **NOVEMBER 2019**
  - Work with methodologist to finalise methods and hypothesis
  - Indonesia-Australia Gender Forum and initial testing of research questions
- **JANUARY- FEBRUARY 2020**
  - Data collection
- **MARCH 2020**
  - Data editing and cleaning
  - Drafting findings and analysis
- **APRIL 2020**
  - Finalising report

The consultant is expected to work **full-time for 100 days** from November 2019 to April 2020 in total and is suggested to spend maximum 20 days in a month.

**Prospera Team**

- Gender and Social Inclusion (GESI) & Public Sector Lead Adviser.
- Senior Researcher.
- Methodologist.
- Research assistants.

**Relationship Management**

All outputs will be home-based. The contractor will be expected to attend meetings at PROSPERA’s office, as and when needed. The consultant will report to PROSPERA’s Public Sector and Gender and Social Inclusion Advisors and will work closely with PROSPERA’s Public Sector Team.
Overview of PROSPERA

PROSPERA is a new partnership facility between the Government of Australia (through Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade) and the Government of Indonesia. It aims to foster strong, sustainable and inclusive economic growth and public sector in Indonesia. Commencing from 1 March 2018, PROSPERA is a planned five-year investment that draws together the former Government Partnership Fund (GPF) and Australia Indonesia Partnership for Economic Governance (AIPEG). PROSPERA will be responsive to the needs of a wide range of agencies in the Indonesian government, covering six thematic areas:

(i) **Markets** – improving product and factor market efficiency;
(ii) **Finance** – delivering financial stability and development;
(iii) **Spending** – improving the quality, delivery efficiency, and access to public services;
(iv) **Revenue** – mobilising revenues without unduly impeding private activity;
(v) **Public Sector Reform** – strengthening economic institutions; and
(vi) **Economics & Inclusion** - providing analysis to boost the evidence for economic policy.

The following standard requirements apply for all PROSPERA team members:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Confidentiality</th>
<th>Conflict of Interest</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Due to the sensitivity of much of the information the position will encounter, there is an obligation, pursuant to the contract of engagement to maintain full confidentiality of information and to not disclose this to third parties without the express written approval of PROSPERA. In some cases, a separate confidentiality agreement may be required authorising the review of sensitive material.</td>
<td>The team member will use her/his best endeavours to ensure that a situation does not arise which may result in a conflict of interest. Where a conflict of interest or a potential conflict of interest arises in the performance of the obligations under this Terms of Reference, the team member must immediately notify the Chief of Operations</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Knowledge and Performance</th>
<th>Diversity and Inclusion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The team member will support PROSPERA’s Knowledge and Performance team through reporting and communication products for knowledge capture and learning purposes. The team member will also support monitoring and evaluation through the supply of high quality data, participation in data collection methods and case studies that may arise from the inputs.</td>
<td>PROSPERA recognises the importance of embracing workplace diversity, specifically valuing the unique qualities, attributes, skills, and experience all employees bring to the workplace. PROSPERA is committed to supporting a positive work environment based on respect. These values should be reflected in the function and behaviour of all team members.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Code of Conduct</th>
<th>Policy Compliance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The team member is to conduct themselves in a manner consistent with the <em>Public Service Act 1999</em> (Cth), (including the Australian Public Service Values and Employment Principles, and Code of</td>
<td>The team member will work within Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade policy and PROSPERA guidelines on gender, child protection, poverty, the environment, human rights, and governance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conduct) and the employer’s professional standards.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Annex 1. List of Relevant Literatures and Reports

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Publication</th>
<th>Research Method</th>
<th>Key Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1  | Cakra Wikara Indonesia, Menyoal Data Representasi Perempuan di Lima Ranah (Exploring the Data on Women’s Representation in Five Sectors) (Jakarta, 2018). | Statistical data analysis and in-depth interview. | • Women are still under-represented in legislative institutions (national and regional), election bodies (KPU and Bawaslu), political parties (DPP), bureaucracy, and regional leadership.  
• Some of the factors that influence women’s under-representation in leadership positions across the five sectors are (1) the practice of the merit system that is still heavily influenced by seniority, favouritism, and negative stereotype towards women; (2) double burden of household care-work and career ambition which affected women’s decision for promotion; and (3) stereotypes about women’s capability and preferences that suggest women are naturally weaker and less competent. |
| 2  | Abdul, Ismail, and Basir (2012), Women Career Advancement in Public Service: A Study in Indonesia, Procedia – Social and Behavioural Sciences 58:298-306. | Survey through questionnaires in three ministries in Jakarta, West Java and three ministries in Aceh, Sumatera using convenience sampling technique. | • The factors that contribute to Indonesian Muslim female public servants’ career success are experience, education, seniority, interpersonal skills, ability in negotiation with their boss, commitment and dedication, support from boss, support from colleagues and family, and leadership styles.  
• Factors that hinder them from career advancement are family prioritisation, limited access to professional training, lack of qualifications, lack of leadership charisma, lack of confidence, social expectation, gender bias/stereotyping, lack of networking opportunities, and absence of mentoring system. |
| 3  | AIPEG and Monash University Centre for Development Economics and Sustainability, Women’s Economic Participation in Indonesia (Jakarta, 2017). | Quantitative analysis of Indonesian Family Life Survey (IFLS) survey data. | • Women on average stop studying at age 18, get married at 22, have their first child at 23, and the second at 27, and the third at 30. Although men and women enter the labour market at approximately the same age and with similar education attainment, gender differences soon start to appear and correspond with the age at which women get married and enter their child-bearing years.  
• Being married and having a child appears to be a big impediment to working in the formal sector, whereas being married and having a child do not seem such a handicap to being self-employed or engaging in unpaid work.  
• Most of the women in self-employment or in unpaid work are working in agriculture, sales and services. Informal sector generally provides more flexibility for women to better juggle work and family commitments. |
<p>| 4  | AIPEG and Monash University, Women’s Economic Participation in | Quantitative analysis of National Socio-Economy Survey (Susenas) data and | • Female labour force participation in Indonesia has remained relatively constant from 1996 to 2013 even in the face of dramatic economic change. Indonesia’s female labour force |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source</th>
<th>Study Title</th>
<th>Methodology</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Indonesia - A Study of Gender Inequality in Employment, Entrepreneurship, and Key Enablers for Change (Jakarta, 2017)</td>
<td>descriptive statistics analysis.</td>
<td>participation rate is 51%, well below male (80%), and relatively low compared to countries at the same stage of development.</td>
<td>The main drivers of low female labour force participation in Indonesia are marriage, children below two years of age in the household, low educational attainment (below upper-secondary and tertiary levels) and changing economic structure (decline in the female-friendly sector of agriculture due to transitions from rural to urban areas in particular). The propensity for women to participate in the labour force appears to be increasing among the younger generation, particularly the more educated living in urban areas.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 SCOPE and ILO (2018), Women in Leadership and Management in Public Sector Undertakings in India.</td>
<td>Multi-level approach involved administering an online survey with women employees in 201 public sector units; FGD of women and men in selected public sector units representing diverse sectors; and interviews with managing directors, heads of HR, and women directors in company boards.</td>
<td>Women respondents have cited two most influential factors that stand-out in their career advancement: women's own confidence and self-belief (43.79%); and organisational opportunities supporting women in their professional development and career growth (26.85%). What women considered to be the greatest hindrances to their career advancement includes: having a skill gap or a knowledge gap in their specialised area, returning to work after a career break or maternity leave, lack of internal motivation or a desire to move up the career ladder. Some of the most cited reasons of women underrepresentation in leadership positions are masculine organisational culture (e.g. stereotypes against women, management viewed as a man’s job), lack of organisational strategy in identifying, promoting and retaining skilled women at higher level, and lack of positive women role models or mentors.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Cave, Oliver, Hayward-Jones, Munro, and Harries, Foreign Territory: Women in International Relations (Sydney, 2019).</td>
<td>Data analysis, review of gender and diversity policies, qualitative survey of 646 respondents (male and female) working in the sector, in-person interview with 50 senior leaders across the sector (male and female).</td>
<td>There is a shortage of women in strategic roles in Australia’s IR sector (diplomatic envoys, government departments with international functions, academia or think tanks, Australian Parliament). Barriers exists in three ways: (1) vertical divide (recruitment and pathways to seniority), (2) horizontal divide (glass curtain division), and (3) international divide (interstate and overseas relocation). Barriers were also influenced by socio-cultural norms (societal expectations of women and assumptions employers may make about women’s preferences) as well as transparency of attaining gender equality goal.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 (EY 2014), Worldwide Women Public Sector Leaders Index 2014 -</td>
<td>Consultation with each of the G20 member states, and verification by at least</td>
<td>There is a general trend that although women are well-represented across the public sectors in G20 countries, they are under-represented in the leadership posts.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Source</td>
<td>Methodology</td>
<td>Findings</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Wilson Center, *Roadmap to 50x50 - Power and Parity in Women’s Leadership* (Global Women’s Leadership Initiative) (Washington, DC, 2018) | Quantitative analysis of 75 countries (35 OECD plus 40 non-OECD countries chosen based on population, regional representation and data availability).                                                                 | • Indonesia is in the “Flat Parity” category, where women are lacking in the highest positions of leadership but are making gains across policy functions.  
• Six key takeaways: (1) pathways: education of all types matters; (2) pathways: part-time work opens paths for women’s leadership; (3) positions: public administration is the starting point for change; (4) power: glass walls exist and breaking through them can help reach the goal of gender parity in government; (5) power: public perception matters most; and (6) power: women in power is linked to good governance. |
| Tiwari, Mathur, and Awasti (2019), *A study on the effects of glass ceiling and organizational commitment on corporate women's turnover intentions*, Academy of Strategic Management Journal, 18,(2). | Electronic survey which targeted women in senior and executive positions in different organizations. | • This study explores how gender discrimination can be turned into a lack of organizational commitment and high turnover intentions among Indian working women in corporate settings. Result from the survey indicates that there is positive and significant relationship between gender discrimination and a lack of organisational commitment and high turnover among Indian women in corporate settings.  
• Women were found to be efficient at their positions, both in leadership and medium-level positions, but perceived as inefficient employees who are burdened with a lot of responsibilities outside work which makes them less attractive for the company. |
| Evans, Edwards, McGregor, and Upton, *Doing it Differently - Staff Perceptions of the Barriers to Workplace Participation Experienced by Public Servants with Disability in the Australian Public Service*, Institute for Governance and Policy Analysis, University of Canberra (Canberra, 2016) | Qualitative analysis via 3 FGDs in each participating department. Quantitative online survey with all participating departments. Further quantitative analysis with data from the APSC 2014 State of the Service Survey. | • Assessment on (1) how successful Departments and agencies have been in expanding the capabilities of employees experiencing disability and enhancing individual wellbeing; and (2) what dimensions of the implementation process for empowering people with disability and enhancing workplace participation are perceived to be effective or not. |
Prospera is supported by the Australian Government and implemented by Cardno